

Zeynali Tazehkandi, Mahdi; Nowkarizi, Mohsen (2023). Analyzing Concepts and Measurements of Overlap: A Literature Review. *Journal of Knowledge-Research Studies*, 1(2): 41-59.

DOI: 10.22034/jkrs.2022.50859.1011

URL: https://jkrs.tabrizu.ac.ir/article_15071.html

The paper is an open access and licensed under the Creative Commons CC BY NC license.



Analyzing Concepts and Measurements of Overlap: A Literature Review

Mahdi Zeynali Tazehkandi¹, Mohsen Nowkarizi*²

Received: March, 27, 2022;

Accepted: June, 15, 2022

Abstract

Purpose: The study's aim is to determine the concepts, methods, and applications of overlap and to describe the differences between the domestic and international studies.

Methodology: The documentary method is used in this study to analyze the concepts of overlap and the differences between the domestic and international studies through a literature review.

Findings: In the overlap area, title overlap, information resources overlap, and topic overlap, have been reported in measuring the databases overlap. A literature review showed that overlap studies had been carried out for one of the following objectives: Overlap theoretical development, explanation of statistical and sampling methods, comparison of the indexing policy of secondary resources, selection of appropriate databases, determination of proper Web search engine, the establishment of interlibrary cooperation, and drawing the relationships among the sciences. It is recommended to use statistical methods to provide the right and enough information for studies. Finally, one may say that the advent of some terms such as journal overlap, journal article overlaps, and topic overlap is due to the researchers' different views. Thus, the topic overlap is used to investigate the indexing policy of the databases and to draw the relationships between the sciences.

Conclusion: Finally, it must be said that theory and practice are intertwined. Therefore, choosing the appropriate method to measure the overlap depends on the research objectives.

Value: This theoretical study is worthwhile as the local studies carried out up to now, are only practical ones.

Keywords: *Relative Overlap, Multidimensional Scaling, Synthetic Freedom, Journal overlap, Journal Article Overlap.*

1. PhD Student, Department of Knowledge and Information Science, Faculty of Education and Psychology, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, Mashhad, Iran.

2. Professor, Department of Knowledge and Information Science, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, Mashhad, Iran (Corresponding Author) mnowkarizi@um.ac.ir

Extended Abstract

Introduction

Overlap is a concept that refers to the intersection of two or many sets. This study aims to determine the idea, methods, and function of overlap. Likewise, the differences between the studies in and out of the country are described.

Methodology

To determine the concept, the methods, and the function of overlap, the overlap and coverage terms are searched on SID, Magiran, and Google Scholar search engines. The title and abstract of the retrieved documents are scanned by the researchers; then, the relevant documents are downloaded and read. The documentary method was used in this study to analyze the concept of overlap and the differences between the researches in and out of the country through a literature Review.

Findings

In principle, the issues of overlap intersections between the collections are examined. Nowadays, the overlapping study of the information resources characteristics (in the case of the book, these include: author, title, subject, publication place, publisher, and editor) is replaced by the information resources themselves. In overlap studies, in the general sense, if two or more things have the same overlap, there is overlap between them. In the context of knowledge and information science, "thing" means libraries, databases, and search engines; and coverage of libraries, databases, and Search engine refers to some kinds of publications (i.e., monographs, books, patents, etc.), articles (not journals), and web pages respectively. Overlap is one of the most critical topics in Scientometrics. New topics, such as journal overlap, journal article overlap, and topic overlap, have been reported in the database overlap studies recently, and various methods have been used to measure it. Different ways can be used to measure overlap, and each works best in a particular situation. One of these methods is the traditional method that ignores the size of the databases and can not be used to show the priority of one database over another. In these cases, the relative overlap is inadequate. It is also recommended to use a multidimensional measurement scale when examining multiple sets. The synthetic degrees of freedom, unlike traditional overlap, are as sensitive as collections, but can not still be used to assess the priority of one base over another. Literature Review showed that overlap studies had been done for one of the following objectives: Theoretical development of overlap, comparison of the indexing policy of secondary sources, selection of suitable databases, determination of convenient Web search engine, the establishment of interlibrary cooperation, and drawing the relationships between the sciences. Likewise, the findings showed are better to use statistical methods to provide the right, and enough information for



Journal of
Knowledge-Research Studies
(JKRS)

Vol 1

Issue 2

Serial Number 2

establishing interlibrary cooperation, the selection of suitable database, and so on. The researchers' view differences caused to report the journal overlaps and journal article overlaps, and Topic overlap used in indexing policy of the databases and drawing the relationships between the sciences.

Conclusion

A literature review carried out abroad reveals that the first issue in the coverage area was journal coverage. Through these studies, the journals' overlap is addressed, and the overlap is theoretically expanded; various statistical and sampling methods are proposed, then these methods are criticized, and their strengths and weaknesses are identified. Eventually, this has led some researchers to develop new research designs to achieve more accurate research results. With the advent of search engines, the methods of calculating overlap have been investigated, and search engine overlap has been measured.

First, in our country (Iran), the degree of journal overlaps in libraries has been decreased to reduce additional costs by establishing the interlibrary loans. In recent years, the study of database overlaps in a specific subject area has also been considered. As, in most of the local overlap studies, they are limited to a particular area rather than using statistical methods, so their results can not be used in decision-making. In addition, by examining the studies done in and out of the country, it is pronounced that in the international studies, if the overlap measurement of the two sets had been investigated, then the fundamental issues such as the purpose of conducting the overlap measurements, concepts of overlap, methodological issues in measuring overlap have been addressed. At the same time, unfortunately in domestic studies, only counting the overlap of collections such as libraries, databases and search engines has been sufficient.

This theoretical study is worthwhile as the local studies carried out up to now, are only practical ones. In the overlap area, the presentation of theoretical concepts, which are the basis of functional definitions, is ignored. In recent years, there has been no review of the international overlap studies. In this regard, the study presents new theoretical concepts. Finally, it must be said that theory and practice are intertwined. Choosing the appropriate method to measure the overlap depends on the research objectives.



Journal of
Knowledge-Research Studies
(JKRS)

Vol 1

Issue 2

Spring 2022

Extended Abstract References

- Abolhassanyfroghi, H (2005). Study of the distribution of Latin scientific journals in the field of social sciences in terms of subject, language, geographical scope and ranking in the field of valid global databases. Master Thesis. Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, Faculty of Educational Sciences and Psychology.
- Alibeiq, M., Jamshidi Orak, R., Asghari Heineh Abad, L. (2011). A Survey on Traditional Overlap, Relative Overlap and Synthetic Degrees of Freedom between PubMed and Scopus in the Cardiovascular Disease Field. *Health Information Management*, 8(3), 345-353. [In Persian].
- Asadolahi, Z and Nowkarizi, M (2010). Evaluating the structure and content of electronic databases of Iranian journals. *Library and Information Sciences*, 13 (2), 113-139. [In Persian].
- Ayto, John, A (2007). *English Etymological Dictionary* (Translated by Hamid Kashanian). Tehran: Nashre-Farhange-No
- Baharat, K., & Broder, A. (1998). "Technique for measuring the relative size and overlap of public web search engines". *Computer network and ISDN sestems*30, 379-388. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0169-7552\(98\)00127-5](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0169-7552(98)00127-5).
- Bearman, T. C., & Kunberger, W. A. (1977). "A Study of Coverage Overlap among Fourteen Major Science and Technology Abstracting and Indexing Services". Philadelphia: National Federation of Abstracting and Indexing Services
- Bradford, S. C. (1937). The extent to which scientific and technical literature is covered by present abstracting and indexing periodicals. *Journal of Chemical Technology and Biotechnology*, 56(43), 947-951.
- Buckland, M.K., Hindle, A., & Walker, P. M. (1975). "Methodological problems in assessing the overlap between bibliographical files and library holdings". *Information Processing and Management* 11(3-4), 89-105. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0306-4573\(75\)90011-4](https://doi.org/10.1016/0306-4573(75)90011-4)
- Davarpanah, M (2011). Search for scientific and research information in print and electronic sources. Tehran: Chappar.
- Dayani, MH, & Hajimohammadi, V (2013). Investigating the extent of overlap and the possibility of replacing Persian printed magazines in the libraries of Ferdowsi University of Mashhad with electronic journals of the Science and Technology Information Center. *Library and Information Sciences*, 14(1), 217-240.[In Persian].
- Dekhoda, A (1993). Dekhoda dictionary. Tehran: University of Tehran.
- Ebrahimi, h (2008). An examination of the degree of overlap in Namayeh and Nama databases in 1384 (2005). *Librarianship and Information Organization Studies*. 18(4), pp 299-308. [In Persian].
- Egghe, L (2006). "Properties of the n-overlap vector and n-overlap similarity theory". *Journal of the American Society for Information Science and Technology*57 (9)1165-1177.
- Egghe, L, & Goovaerts, M (2007). "A note on measuring overlap". *Journal of Information Science*.33 (2), 189-195. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0165551506075325>
- Farajpahlo, A (2017). Informatics. Retrived from 2 june 2017, at <http://portal.nlai.ir/daka/Wiki>
- Gavel, Ylva, & and Iselid, Lars (2008). Web of Science and Scopus: a journal title overlaps study. *Online Information Review*. 32 (1), 8-21. DOI:10.1108/14684520810865958
- Ghazi Mirsaeid S J, Pouramini Z. (2014) Survey on Overlaps Between Articles in Web of Science and Scopus In Cardiovascular Field (2001 To 2010). *Payavard*. 7 (6) , 535-543. [In Persian].



Journal of
Knowledge-Research Studies
(JKRS)

Vol 1

Issue 2

Serial Number 2

- Gluck, Myke (1990). "A Review of Journal Coverage Overlap with an Extension to the Definition of Overlap". *Journal of the American society for information science* 41(1), 43-60. [https://doi.org/10.1002/\(SICI\)1097-4571\(199001\)41:1<43::AID-ASI4>3.0.CO;2-P](https://doi.org/10.1002/(SICI)1097-4571(199001)41:1<43::AID-ASI4>3.0.CO;2-P)
- Hazeri A, Tavakolizadeh Ravari M, & Ebrahimi V. (2015) A Study of Subject Overlap between the Main Categories of Knowledge Management within the Web of Science. *Iranian Journal of Information Processing and Management*. 30 (4) :997-1023. [In Persian].
- Hood, w.w. and Wilson, C.S. (2003). Overlap in bibliographic databases. *Journal of the American Society for Information Science and Technology*. 54 (12), 1091-1103. <https://doi.org/10.1002/asi.10301>
- Hoveida, Alireza (2011). *Statistics in Librarianship and Information Science*. Tehran: Samt.
- Isfandyari Moghaddam A, Bahari Movaffagh Z. (2012). The Overlap Rate of Searching Medical Keywords in General Search Engines. *Health Information Management*. 9(2), 214. [In Persian].
- Isfandyari Moghaddam, A., & Parioikh, M. (2006). A comparative study on overlapping of search results in metasearch engines and their common underlying search engines. *Library Review*, 55(5), 301-306.
- Katzer, J., Tessier, J., Frakes, W., & Das-Gupta, P. (2017, August). A study of the overlap among document representations. In *ACM SIGIR Forum* (Vol. 51, No. 2, pp. 26-34). New York, NY, USA: ACM.
- Khalili, K (1993). *Dictionary of Persian Derivatives*. Tehran: Moassesate Farhangi.
- Kimball, R. (2016). Journal overlap analysis of the GeoRef and Web of Science databases. *Science & Technology Libraries*, 35(1), 91-98. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0194262X.2015.1128374>
- Kimball, R. (2020). Journal Overlap of the GEOBASE Database with the GeoRef and Web of Science Databases. *The Serials Librarian*, 79(1-2), 107-117. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0361526X.2020.1778601>
- Martyn, J. (1967). Tests on abstracts journals: Coverage overlap and indexing. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1108/eb026420>
- Noshinfard, F and Emami, Z (2013). Traditional and Relative Overlap of <PopMed> and <WebAcience> Databases in Endocrine Diseases. *Quarterly Journal of Information Systems and Services*, 1(3), 89-101. [In Persian].
- Nowkarizi M, & Zeinali M. (2017) The overlap and coverage of 4 local search engines: Parsijoo, Yooz, Parseek and Rismoun. *Human Information Interaction*, 4 (3), 48-59. [In Persian].
- Overlap - Dictionary Definition. (n.d.). Retrieved December 30, 2016, from <https://www.vocabulary.com/dictionary/overlap>
- Overlap Meaning in *the Cambridge English Dictionary*. (n.d.). Retrieved December 30, 2016, from <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/overlap>
- Overlap. (n.d.). Retrieved December 30, 2016, from <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/overlap>
- Poyer, R K. (1984). "Journal Article Overlap among Index Medicus Science Citation Index, Biological Abstracts, and Chemical Abstracts". *Bull. Med. Libr. Assoc.* 72(4).
- Rather, R. A., Lone, F. A., & Shah, G. J. (2008). Overlap in Web search results: A study of five search engines. *Library Philosophy and Practice (e-journal)*, 226.
- Sievert, M.C. And. Andrews, M.J. (1991). "Indexing Consistency in Information Science Abstracts". *Journal of the American society for information science*. 42 (1), 1-6. [https://doi.org/10.1002/\(SICI\)1097-4571\(199101\)42:13.0.CO;2-9](https://doi.org/10.1002/(SICI)1097-4571(199101)42:13.0.CO;2-9)
- Tajadin, R (2000). Investigating the Overlap of the Titles of Periodicals (1996) in the Field of Agriculture in Specialized and University Libraries of Tehran Province. *Academic Librarianship and Information Research*, 32(34), 30-34
- Wood, J; and Flanagan, C. and kenned, h.E. (1972). Overlap in the Lists of Journals Monitored by Bios is, CAS, and Ei. *Journal of the American Society for Information Science*, 23(1), 36 – 38.



Journal of
Knowledge-Research Studies
(JKRS)

Vol 1

Issue 2

Spring 2022